LONG ISLAND CENTER FOR SOCIO-ECONOMIC POLICY

THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC IMPACT

OF

THE ARBORETUM: REDEVELOPMENT OF 62 ACRES AT 510 HORSEBLOCK ROAD, FARMINGVILLE, NEW YORK

PREPARED FOR

KELLY BUILDERS OF FARMINGVILLE, LLC.

PREPARED BY

DR. MARTIN R. CANTOR, CPA

December 2018

The Long Island Center for Socio-Economic Policy Director, Dr. Martin R. Cantor, CPA 28 Woodmont Road Melville, New York 11747 Tel: (631) 491-1388 Fax: (631) 491-6744 E-Mail: <u>EcoDev1@aol.com</u> WEB SITE: WWW.MARTINCANTOR.COM

The Socio-Economic Impact of The Arboretum:

Redevelopment of 62 Acres at 510 Horseblock Road, Farmingville, New York

Table of Contents

December 2018

Abstract	Page	3
Introduction	Page	4
Farmingville's Population Decreases While Brookhaven Town Grows	Page	5
Farmingville is Losing Its Young People	Page	6
Sachem Central School District Declining Student Enrollment	Page	7
Farmingville Households Decrease While Brookhaven Town Grows	Page	8
Farmingville Household Income Lags Behind Town of Brookhaven	Page	9
The Arboretum Brings New Economic Activity To Farmingville	Page	10
Conclusion	Page	11
References	Page	12
Bio of Dr. Martin R. Cantor, CPA	Page	13

ABSTRACT

The Arboretum will bring much needed economic activity to the Farmingville community. The Arboretum, created by the redevelopment of a blighted and underutilized property will be 730 construction jobs with a direct payroll of \$36.5 million, 1,095 secondary jobs with aggregate payroll of \$38.3 million and over \$3.4 million in new Suffolk County sales tax revenues. The permanent and recurring direct economic activity from the residents of The Arboretum will bring a minimum aggregate gross annual household income of nearly \$29.1 million to the Farmingville community, 324 primary and secondary jobs with aggregate payroll of \$12.5 million and generate over \$532,962 in new and recurring Suffolk County sales taxes.

The residents of The Arboretum will reinvigorate the decreasing Farmingville households and aging population. Between 2000 and 2016 Farmingville's population decreased by 6.6 percent as compared to the 8.9 percent increase in the population of the Town of Brookhaven. During that same period, Farmingville's households decreased by 8.3 percent while Town of Brookhaven households increased by 9.5% percent.

Farmingville's changing demographics have also impacted the Sachem Central School District. Sachem Central School district 2016 student enrollment decreased by 2,061 or 13.2 percent from the 2005-2006 school year. Since 2000, total enrollments decreased by 9.3 percent, kindergarten decreased by 8.3%, Grades 1-6 decreased by 21.3 percent and Grades 7-12 increased by 4.2 percent. The instructional cost to educate any children from The Arboretum will result in a net property tax benefit to the school district. The Arboretum will be paying more in school taxes than the pro rata instructional cost for educating any children from The Arboretum, with The Arboretum in effect subsidizing the public education of children of single-family home owners attending Sachem Central schools.

INTRODUCTION

In support of the application for financial assistance from the Town of Brookhaven Industrial Development Agency, we have been retained by Kelly Builders of Farmingville, LLC to prepare a report of the projected economic impact generated in the Town of Brookhaven community of Farmingville from the redevelopment of a mulch mixing facility on 62 vacant and blighted acres into The Arboretum, a 292-unit residential development.

The Arboretum is comprised of 292 residential units and a 100,000 gallon per day capacity, state of the art, sewage treatment plant. Included in the 292 residential units are 134 two-bedroom Flats at market rents, 30 two-bedroom Flats at lower affordable housing rents, 77 three-bedroom Town Homes, and 51 single family three- and four-bedroom cottages.

The economic activity generated from The Arboretum is achievable because the zoning of the property as MF (multi-family) allows for the 292 residential units. The projected economic activity from The Arboretum will create new jobs; attract new businesses; generate a positive trend in neighborhood real estate values; create other new housing opportunities by diversifying housing stock; encourage development of other vacant and underutilized Farmingville properties for commercial and residential uses; generate additional local and school district tax revenues while not overburdening student enrollment; and create a sense of place that will enhance and improve Farmingville's aesthetics, green spaces and overall environment.

Kelly Builders of Farmingville, LLC is prepared to bring its investment in the redevelopment of the 62 acres to nearly \$110 million to construct a 292-unit residential community conserving green space, preserving an historic fire department structure and single family detached building, and constructing a community center that will accommodate local civic organizations and the community's residents. The new residents of these units will provide a much-needed injection of economic activity to a post-Great Recession Farmingville community.

The development at The Arboretum will be on a previously underutilized and vacant property, most recently used as a mulch mixing facility and will bring socio-economic improvements to the Farmingville community that are compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

The development will provide needed housing for Long Island's young professionals and active adults; create nearly 1,825 temporary construction and secondary jobs, 324 permanent primary and secondary jobs; and generate upwards of \$3.96 million dollars of new sales tax revenues for

Suffolk County. The new \$19 million of recurring economic activity that The Arboretum will attract can only benefit local Farmingville businesses.

The Sachem Central School District, currently receiving \$60,000 in property taxes from the vacant 62 acres, will benefit from an estimated \$1.1 million of new property tax revenues generated by The Arboretum, a community that may generate up to 47 school age children, which should not overburden a Sachem Central School District that has had increasing budgets had decreasing enrollments since 2005. Similar residential communities indicate that few, if any, have children attending local schools. Recent examples include "The Riverwalk" - a 163-unit condominium development in Patchogue which has no school age children, the 290-rental unit "New Village" in Patchogue has five children attending local schools and the 166-rental unit "Mill Creek" in Hempstead has only 4 school age children.

Research by the Urban Land Institute (ULI) affirms that higher-density housing with fewer families with children, such as The Arboretum, puts less demand on schools and other public services as compared to low density housing such as single-family homes. ULI research also noted that higher-density development generates less traffic than low-density development such as single-family homes and puts less stress on emergency fire and police services.

The following analysis presents how The Arboretum benefits the Farmingville community's socio-economic quality of life.

POPULATION: FARMINGVILLE DECREASES AS BROOKHAVEN TOWN GROWS

As illustrated in Table 1, Farmingville's population decreased by 6.65 percent between 2000 and 2016 as compared to the 8.89 percent increase in the Town of Brookhaven's population.

	<u>2000</u>	<u>2010</u>	<u>2016</u>	Increase (Decrease) 2000-2016	<u>%</u> <u>Increase</u> (Decrease) 2000-2016
Brookhaven:	448,248	486,040	488,123	39,875	8.89%
Farmingville	16,458	15,481	15,363	(1,095)	(6.65%)

 Table 1: Total Population Growth: Town Brookhaven and Farmingville - 2000-2016

Source: U.S. Census 2000 Summary File 1 Table DP-1; U.S. Census 2010-American FactFinder Table DP-1, U.S. Census 2016-American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates 2012- 2016 Table DP05.

Further, as a percent of the Town of Brookhaven population, Farmingville's population decreased by 15 percent from 3.67 percent in 2000 to 3.15 percent in 2016. The Arboretum at

Farmingville would contribute to reversing the trend of people leaving Farmingville by attracting new residents to the community and the Town of Brookhaven.

THE AGING OF FARMINGVILLE: FARMINGVILLE LOSING ITS' YOUNG PEOPLE

As in The Town of Brookhaven, the Farmingville community has aged without an offsetting influx of younger families. Table 2 illustrates that the under 5 population in the Town of Brookhaven has decreased as a percentage of the population between 2000 and 2016 as did those between 5 and 54 years of age while those over 55 grew. Those under 5 years of age in the Farmingville community fell by 51.3 percent between 2000 and 2016 to 3.8 percent of Farmingville's population while those over 55 increased by 56.5 percent to 24.9 percent of the Farmingville population.

Farmingville's 14.5 percent population loss between 2000 and 2016 of those 5 to 54 years of age was over 24 times greater than the .6 percent decrease of those between the ages of 5 and 54 years of age in the Town of Brookhaven. Additionally, the 56.5 percent growth of those over 55 years of age in Farmingville was comparable to the 55.3 percent growth rate of the Town of Brookhaven demographic.

Age	Town of Brookhaven		Farmingville	
	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>
Total Pop.	448,248 (100%)	488,123 (100%)	16,458 (100%)	15,363 (100%)
Under 5	31,871 (7.1%)	27,497 (5.6%)	1,204 (7.3%)	586 (3.8%)
5-54 Yrs	332,776 (74.2%)	330,782 (67.8%)	12,813 (77.9%)	10,956 (71.3%)
Over55	83,601 (18.7%)	129,844 (26.6%)	2,441 (14.8%)	3,821 (24.9%)
Median Age	35.2 Yrs	39.3Yrs (+11.6%)	34.1Yrs	39.6 Yrs (+16.1%)

Table 2: Population By Age-2000-2016-The Aging of Brookhaven Town and Farmingville

Source: U.S. Census-2000 Summary File 1; U.S. Census-American Community Survey 2012-2016.

While Farmingville's over 55 years of age population increased at nearly the same rate as the Town of Brookhaven, Farmingville's future, as does Long Island's, relies on attracting young families to the community. Countering the exodus of young people from Farmingville, as illustrated by the 16.1 percent increase in the median age of Farmingville residents, as compared to the 11.6 percent median age increase in the town of Brookhaven,

The families at The Arboretum will become a market for available single-family residential housing in the community. As Table 3 illustrates, that young families with children attracted to The Arboretum will not overburden the Sachem Central School District but would offset the declining enrollment that the school district has experienced since 2005. The Arboretum will also generate \$1.1 million of new school property taxes from the current \$60,000.

SACHEM CENTRAL SCHOOLS: DECLINING STUDENT ENROLLMENT

Table 3 illustrates that 2016 student enrollment at the Sachem Central School District has decreased by 2,061 or 13.2 percent from the 2005-2006 school year. This is reflective of a combination of factors. The first is that the final wave of offspring from the baby boomers and their children are working their way through the Sachem Central School System with the result being lower enrollments in the Kindergarten and grades 1-6. The other is that as shown in Table 2 there has been a 51.3 percent decrease in children under 5 years of age that would enroll in the Sachem Central School system. During this period of declining enrollments school budgets have been increasing.

Of greater interest is that since 2005 total enrollment has decreased by 13.2%, kindergarten by 19.8 percent, Grades 1-6 by 16.2 percent and Grades 7-12 by 9.4 percent. To maintain its' teaching staff, parents of young children must be attracted to the Sachem Central School district for enrollment in the early grades. Recent examples of regional multi-family developments suggest that any new students from The Arboretum will not overburden the Sachem Central school district.

Table 3: Total Sachem Central School District Student Enrollment-Decreasing Since 2005						
	<u>2000-2001</u>	<u>2005-2006</u>	<u>2009-2010</u>	<u>2015-2016</u>	2005-2016	
					Increase	
					(Dec	crease)
Total Enrollment	14,948(100%)	15,623 (100%)	14,760 (100%)	13,562(100%)	(2,061)	(13.2%)
Kindergarten	997 (6.7%)	1,139 (7.3%)	1,041 (7.1%)	914 (6.7%)	(225)	(19.8%)
Grades 1-6	7,429 (49.7%)	6,980 (44.7%)	6,730 (45.6%)	5,849(43.1%)	(1,131)	(16.2%)
Grades 7-12	6,522 (43.6%)	7,504(48.0%)	6,989 (47.3%)	6,799(50.2%)	(705)	(9.4%)
Instructional	\$7,895.00	\$9,162.00	\$9,201.00	\$10,488		
Cost per Student		+16%	+.43%	+14%		

Table 3: Total Sachem Central School District Student Enrollment-Decreasing Since 2005

Source: New York State Education Department School Report Cards.

Table 3 further illustrates that the 2000 instructionall cost per student at the Sachem Central School District of \$7,895.00 grew by 32.8 percent to \$10,488.00 in 2016. The instructional cost to educate any children from The Arboretum will be offset by the projected \$1.1 million of new school property taxes, an increase from the current \$60,000. The result is a net property tax benefit to the school district, with The Arboretum paying more in school taxes than the pro rata instructional cost of educating any children from The Arboretum. In effect, The Arboretum will be contributing to the public education of children from single-family homes attending Sachem Central School District.

Recent examples of school age children living in multi-family developments include "The Riverwalk" - a 163-unit condominium development in Patchogue which has no school age children, the 290-rental unit "New Village" in Patchogue which has five children attending local schools, and the 166-rental unit "Mill Creek" at 303 Main Street in Hempstead which has 4 school age children.

Additionally, research by the Urban Land Institute (ULI) concluded that higher-density housing with fewer families with children, such as The Arboretum, puts less demand on schools and other public services as compared to low density housing such as single-family homes. ULI research also noted that higher-density development generates less traffic than low-density development such as single-family homes and puts less stress on emergency fire and police services.

FARMINGVILLE HOUSEHOLDS: DECREASING AS SUFFOLK COUNTY GROWS

Household Size	Town of Brookhaven		Farmingville		
	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>	
Average Household Size	2.97	3.04	3.26	3.32	
Total Households	146,828	160,785	5,041	4,621	
H/H Increase 2000-2015		+9.51%		-8.3%	

Table 4:Occupied Households-Town of Brookhaven and Farmingville.

Source: U.S.Census-2000 Table DP01; U. S. Census American Community Survey 2012-2016 Tables DP01, DP03.

As presented in Table 4, there has been a notable 8.3 percent decrease in Farmingville households between 2000 and 2016 from 5,041 to 4,621. This is in contrast with the 9.51 percent

increase in Town of Brookhaven households during the same period. Additionally, the size of Farmingville households has increased by 1.8 percent between 2000 and 2016, as compared to the 2.4 percent growth in the size of Town of Brookhaven households.

HOUSEHOLD INCOME: FARMINGVILLE LAGS BEHIND TOWN OF BROOKHAVEN

Table 5 illustrates how the growth of household income in Farmingville compared to the household income growth in The Town of Brookhaven.

	Town of Brookhaven		Farmingville	
	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2000</u>	<u>2016</u>
Median Household Income	\$62,475	\$87,728	\$69,148	\$90,790
" Increase 2000-2016		+40.4 %		+31.3%
Inflation adj Median H/H Inc	\$62,475	\$60,716	\$69,148	\$62,905
" Dec/Inc 2000-2016		-2.8%		-9.0%
Mean Household Income	\$72,619	\$105,137	\$77,083	\$109,898
" Increase 2000-2016		+44.8%		+42.6%
Inflation adj Mean H/H Inc.	\$72,619	\$ 72,845	\$77,083	\$76,144
" Decrease 2000-2016		0 %		-1.2 %

Table 5: Household Income-Town of Brookhaven and Farmingville.

Source: U.S.Census-2000 Table DP-3; U. S. Census American Community Survey 2012-2016Table DP03.

Inflation adjusted median and mean Household Incomes in 2016 expressed in year 2000 dollars and based on CPI 1982-84=100 for New York Metropolitan Statistical Area.

The nominal (not adjusted for inflation) Town of Brookhaven average or mean household income increased by 44.8 percent between 2000 and 2016 from \$72,619 to \$105,137, as compared to the 42.6 percent growth in Farmingville's 2016 mean household income of \$109,898. While the percent growth in mean household income was relatively equivalent, the median household income in the Town of Brookhaven grew by 40.4 percent between 2000 and 2016, 29.1 percent greater than Farmingville's 31.3 percent median household income growth.

When adjusted for inflation, as compared to the Town of Brookhaven, the real Farmingville mean and median household incomes fared worse between 2000 and 2016. Adjusting for inflation

is presenting the 2016 nominal household income in 2000 dollars by using changes in the Consumer Price Index. This allows for comparison of increases and decreases in median and mean household incomes using the same dollar basis.

Farmingville's real inflation adjusted median household income decreased by 9.0 percent between 2000 and 2016, while the Town of Brookhaven's real median household income decreased by 2.8 percent. Similarly, in the change between 2000 and 2016 of the inflation adjusted real mean household income, Farmingville households decreased by 1.2 percent, as compared to Town of Brookhaven households which remained relatively unchanged.

THE ARBORETUM BRINGS NEW ECONOMIC ACTIVITY TO FARMINGVILLE

As presented in Table 6, the 292 units at The Arboretum will create 730 construction jobs with a direct payroll of \$36.5 million. The primary construction jobs will in turn generate 1,095 secondary jobs with a total payroll of \$38.3 million. Also, generated by the construction activity will be nearly \$3.4 million in new Suffolk County sales tax revenues.

	<u>Temporary Ec</u>	conomic Activity	Recurring Economic Activity		
	From Construction Activity		From New Residents The Arboretum		
	Primary	Secondary	Primary	Secondary	
Jobs	730	1,095	216	108	
Direct Payroll	\$36,500,000	\$38,325,000	\$8,749,029	\$3,791,246	
Constr.Materials	\$32,000,000	\$16,000,000			
Sales Taxes	\$ 1,688,313	\$ 1,738,727	\$ 371,834	\$ 161,128	
Household Inc.			\$18,956,229		

Table 6: Economic Activity From The Arboretum for the Farmingville Community

Note: Household income is net of income taxes; Sales taxes computed on Suffolk County rate of 4.25%.

The permanent and recurring economic activity generated by the residents of The Arboretum will bring to Farmingville economic activity lost since the Great Recession. The residents of The Arboretum will bring a minimum aggregate gross household income of nearly \$29.1 million, net economic activity of \$19 million, which will generate 324 primary and secondary jobs and their associated \$12.5 million in permanent and secondary recurring economic activity. The projected

consumer activity of the permanent residents of The Arboretum and the new jobs created by them will generate over \$532,962 annually in new Suffolk County sales taxes.

CONCLUSION

The Arboretum at Farmingville will bring much needed economic activity to the Farmingville community that will financially benefit the Sachem Central School District while not overburdening student enrollment. The nearly 1,825 jobs created by the primary construction and secondary jobs as well as the 324 permanent primary and secondary jobs will result in approximately \$87.4 million of direct and secondary payroll, generate over \$3.96 million in new Suffolk County sales tax revenues, and provide approximately \$1.1 million of new school property tax revenues for the Sachem Central School District from the current \$60,000.

The Arboretum will have minimal impact on student enrollment in the Sachem Central School District. When compared with other recent examples of multi-residential communities in Suffolk County, there will be few school age children living at The Arboretum. The real challenge confronting Farmingville is not the residents of The Arboretum but is the loss of young people in Farmingville and the declining enrollment in the Sachem Central School District. The Arboretum will be sending more new school property taxes to the Sachem Central School District than the instructional cost to educate the children; a net financial gain for the Sachem Central School District.

Taking all these factors into consideration, The Arboretum will have a positive socio-economic impact on the Farmingville Community and the Sachem Central School District.

REFERENCES

- Consumer Price Index. U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. Consumer Price Index NY Area (1982-84=100); Dec.2000=182.5, Dec 2016=263.4.
- New York State Education Department. The New York School District Report Card for the Sachem Central Union Free School District: Albany, New York, 2000-2001, 2005-06, 2009-2010 and 2015-2016.
- United States Census Bureau. American Fact Finder. Profile of General Population and Housing Statistics: 2012-2016 Table DP05. 2010 Demographic Table DP-1. Profile Data. From Internet 31 October 2018. <u>http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tables/services</u>.
- United States Census Bureau. American Factfinder. Selected Economic Characteristics. 2012-2016 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates. Table DP05. From Internet 31 October 2018. <u>http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices</u>.
- United States Census Bureau. American Factfinder. Selected Economic Characteristics. 2006-2010 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates. Table DP03. From Internet 31 October 2018. <u>http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices</u>.
- United States Census Bureau. American Factfinder. Profile of Population and Housing Chractristics:2010 Demographic Profile Data. Table DP-1. From Internet 31 October 2018. <u>http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices</u>
- United States Census Bureau. American Factfinder Table DP-3 Profile of Selected Economic Characteristics: 2000 Census 2000 Summary File 3 (SF 3). From Internet 31 October 2018. http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices.
- Unites States Census Bureau. United States Census 2000: Summary of General Demographic Characteristics, Summary File 1 (SF 1), Table DP-1. From Internet 31, October 2018. http://facfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices.
- United States Census Bureau. United States Census 2000: Profile of Selected Economic Characteristics. Table DP-3. From Internet 31, October 2018. http://facfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices.
- Urban Land Institute. Haughey, Richard M. *Higher-Density Development: Myth and Fact.* Washington, D.C. 2005.

Dr. MARTIN R. CANTOR, CPA Director, Long Island Center for Socio-Economic Policy 28 Woodmont Road, Melville, New York 11747 www.martincantor.com

Tel: (631) 491-1388 - Fax: (631) 491-6744-E - Mail: EcoDev1@aol.com

Martin R. Cantor has a Bachelor of Science Degree in Accounting from Brooklyn College of the City University of New York, a Master of Arts Degree in Interdisciplinary Studies from Hofstra University focusing on the socio-economic relationships between education, household income, community and workforce development, and a Doctor of Education Degree from Dowling College. He has served as Suffolk County Economic Development Commissioner (New York State's largest suburban county), brought Computer Associates to Suffolk County, and created over 23,000 jobs with an estimated \$1.4 billion annual payroll economic impact. He has served as: Vice-Chair-Suffolk County Industrial Development Agency; Chief Economist-New York State Assembly Subcommittee for the Long Island Economy; Senior Fellow at the White Plains, New York based Institute for Socioeconomic Studies - a public policy think tank concentrating on poverty in America and senior citizen quality of life; Chair and Chief Economist of the Long Island Development Corp; a building trades labor/management arbitrator; a consultant to the Nassau Interim Financial Authority; a faculty member in the Brooklyn College Department of Economics; Executive Director of the Patchogue Village Business Improvement District; and Director of Economic Development and Chief Economist for Sustainable Long Island, and the Long Island Fund for Sustainable Development, providing financial, technical assistance to businesses and not-for-profit organizations His work is included in the National Tax Rebate-A New America With Less Government, and has prepared downtown revitalization plans for Long Island and New York City neighborhoods featuring arts districts, economic restructuring, waterfront projects and community organizing. He was the architect of the Nassau County Comptroller's debt restructuring plan for resolving Nassau County's fiscal crisis; has been a Long Island Business Journal columnist; has authored: federal, state and local legislation; economic impact analysis; analysis of Long Island's economic, demographic, employment, tax, and educational bases; a convention center feasibility study; taxpaver cost of acquiring open space; and health care reform; and Director of Dowling College's Long Island Economic and Social Policy Institute; and an Adjunct Associate Professor of Economics

He is a Certified Public Accountant in private practice; Director of the Long Island Center for Socio-Economic Policy, chief economist for Destination LI, a consulting economist and economic development consultant to public officials, counties, towns, villages, Industrial Development Agencies, and communities; and Chairman of the Suffolk County Judicial Facilities Agency which financed the acquisition of the Cohalan State Court Complex, oversaw the construction of the Suffolk County Jail in Yaphank and financed the \$70 million purchase/leaseback of the Dennison Building to Suffolk County. He provides economic and business commentary on television and radio; was Co-host of Focus 55, a public affairs program on Channel 55, is a columnist for the Long Island Business News, Long Island's largest business weekly, and Networking Newspaper for Women, has appeared in the New York Times, Newsday, and LI Pulse, and has been syndicated nationally by Newsday, Bridge News and Knight-Ridder/Tribune News Service. He is an Honorary Member of Delta Mu Delta - The National Honor Society in Business Administration and has been recognized by the National Association of Counties for innovative uses of Industrial Revenue Bonds, for international trade promotion initiatives, for downtown revitalization policies, and for minority business incubator initiatives. He was invited by Dr. William Julius Wilson of Harvard University's John F. Kennedy School of Government to present his paper entitled Race Neutral Sustainable Economic Development. He is the author of the recently published Long Island, The Global Economy and Race: The Aging of America's First Suburb.